Equitable Discipline Practices and Policies

Therese Sandomierski, Ph.D.
Florida’s Positive Behavior Support Project
University of South Florida

@PBIS_Therese
Talking about policy

Bored

Irrelevant

Dubious

“This policy stuff doesn’t really matter”

“Policy won’t change outcomes.”

“I don’t have the power to change policy.”
“Policy doesn’t really matter.”
Early Education in the United States

Families & churches, private schools for those who could afford them

1820's-30's: Urban growth & immigration

1837: First colleges for African Americans, women

1849: Common school system in CT, first “compulsory attendance” laws

“Unless we educate our immigrants they will be our ruin. It is no longer a question of benevolence, of duty, or of enlightened self-interest...we are prompted to it by the instinct of self-preservation.” - Calvin Stowe
Post-Civil War Education in the United States

1867: Department of Education

1877: Reconstruction period ends, Jim Crow laws established

POLICY
- Upper-Class White European values

POLICY
- Inadequate school funding, unequitable supports

POLICY
- Limit access to equal education

http://www.eds-resources.com/educationhistorytimeline.html
The Carlisle Indian School, 1879-1918

“Left in the surroundings of savagery, he grows to possess a savage language, superstition, and life. . .”

- Federally funded
- >12,000 indigenous children
- 140 different tribes
- Model for >150 additional schools

http://chnm.gmu.edu/cyh/primary-sources/291
Firing teachers without cause: Malcom Gladwell’s *Revisionist History* “Miss Buchanan’s Period of Adjustment”

January 17, 1956

Get at least seventy-five organizations, churches and individuals, Whites and Negroes of your county to wire the Governor immediately, urging him to veto Senate Bill 12, giving Mason County Board of Education power to fire teachers without cause, and all other unamerican, undemocratic and bias bills which make Alabama so ridiculous in the eyes of the nation.

**QUIT WORRYING**

about which public school your child may be compelled to attend next year. Let us explain how you can get a first class private education at a modest cost.

**STONESTRAW JACOON ACADEMY**

CALL 293-1922 OR 669-4631 OR WRITE BOX 1246, FLORENCE.

**ZER0 TOLERANCE**

Use of profanity, verbal threats or any act of violence will NOT be tolerated on school grounds or at school events.
“Integrated” Schools

“Within the segregated environment, it seems that there [was] a bit more nurturing going on ...more ways where students would be inspired to achieve, rather than being relegated to some back room, or down in the basement, or becoming an untouchable within that environment with low expectations. And when people have low expectations, they blame the victim rather than assume responsibility for their learning.”

(Horsford & McKenzie, 2008, p. 450)
H.B. 674

Lays the foundation for implementing equity recommendations
“Policies won’t change outcomes.”
Effective Policies

- Set clear priorities
- Reduce effects of explicit bias
- Enable effective practices
- Reduce utilization of practices that result in disparities
“Model” Policies

San Francisco Unified School District:

Miami-Dade SCOC:

Arlington Independent School District:
Key Elements of Policies to Address Discipline Disproportionality

The Seven Elements & Their Critical Features

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Key Element</th>
<th>Critical Features</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Specific Commitment to Equity</td>
<td>- Specific language that expresses a commitment to equity (e.g., racial, cultural, ability) - Inclusion of equity in district mission statements - Explicit language related to the improvement or maintenance of equity in school documents (e.g., newsletters, proposals, school improvement plans) - Hiring preferences for equitable outcomes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Family Partnerships in Policy Development</td>
<td>- Commitment to regularly including and using input from a range of families - Recruiting family leaders and including them in school and district decision making - Provision of information on school and district policies and procedures - Regular evaluation of effectiveness of family engagement programs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Focus on Implementing Positive, Proactive Behavior Support Practices</td>
<td>- Adoption of behavior prevention models with instructional focus - Definition and regular teaching of positive behaviors for students and staff - Focus on creating support structures for effective implementation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Clear, Objective Discipline Procedures</td>
<td>- Rights and responsibilities for adults and students are defined - Procedural behaviors are operationally defined - Clear delineations between major and minor behavior incidents</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Removal or Reduction of Exclusionary Practices</td>
<td>- Clear communication that suspension or expulsion is limited to behavior ide</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Commitment to equity

Focus on PBIS

Avoid exclusionary practices

Clear & objective procedures

Instructional hierarchy of responses

Accountability for equitable outcomes

Family partnerships

7 Elements of Effective Policies for Equity

Policy explicitly discourages exclusionary discipline

Explicitly states what educators will do instead:
- Culturally responsive
- Instructional
- Proactive
- Positive
- Clear & consistent
Culturally Responsive Policies

are developed in partnership with families who are ethnically, racially, and culturally different from the majority of school & district staff.

Representative workgroups that include:
- Ethnicity & race
- Gender identity, LGBTQ+ individuals
- Disciplinary history
- Disability/504/foster care status
- Time in country/state/neighborhood
- Common pre-K centers/after-school centers, etc.
- Grade level, academic concerns, siblings in other grades
Accountability for Equitable Outcomes

Use data

Provide support

Share data
Policy Goals:

- Explicit guidance that exclusionary discipline should be avoided
- Equity is obvious throughout the policy, disproportionality is identified & addressed
- Stakeholders know what educators will specifically do to address disparities & support students
- Students can bring their whole selves to school.
Effective Discipline Practices and Policies
Texas Equity Summit
December 12, 2018

EFFECTIVE DISCIPLINE POLICIES

Working with a partner, identify ways to turn these non-examples into examples of effective policy statements. For more information, examples and non-examples of effective discipline policies for equity, download the OSEP PBS TA Center’s policy guide: https://bit.ly/2B3Plyv

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Effective policy checklist</th>
<th>Non-example</th>
<th>Example</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Identify ways these non-examples could be made into examples of effective policies to support equity.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Explicit guidance that exclusionary discipline should be avoided</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Equity is obvious throughout the policy, disproportionality is identified &amp; addressed</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stakeholders know what educators will specifically do to address disparities &amp; support students</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Students can bring their whole selves to school.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Be prepared to share with the group.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1. Set clear priorities
   - Specific about relevant forms of disproportionality
   - Equity is front and center throughout policy
   - Demonstrate how disparities will be addressed

2. Reduce the effects of implicit bias
   - Explicit bias refers to consciously held beliefs for or against people, things, or practices
   - Examples include bias against certain styles of dress, hairstyles, language, etc.

"The school district does not discriminate against employees, applicants for employment, students, or anyone else with respect to education programs, activities, or employment practices on the basis of gender, race, color, national origin, age, religion, sexual orientation, familial status, disability or any other characteristic protected by law."

"It is the policy of the San Francisco Unified School District to provide each student with equal opportunities to succeed. The lack of English skills will not be a barrier to admission and participation in any program."

"The district implements a non-discrimination policy that enforces transgender students’ right to be addressed by a name and pronoun corresponding to their gender identity as expressed by the student. It has access to the restroom, locker room, or other facilities consistent with their gender identity as expressed by the student, its participants in the dress code, gym class, athletics, competitions or any other circumstance where students are separated by gender or school activities or programs (i.e., class discussion, field trips) in accordance with their gender identity as expressed by the student."

"Our mission is to ensure these strategies are implemented with a culturally responsive lens that looks at the individual strengths of students and families and respects their cultural background and heritage."

"Hair including cuts, color, and styles should not interfere with the learning process or values being upheld. San Francisco School-Hair for boys and girls should be neat, clean, and conservative, and the natural color at all times."
“I don’t have the power to change policy.”
Competing Behavior Pathway

**Student-Driven Instruction**
Setting Events

**Peer nominations**
Antecedent

**Sagging Pants**
Behavior

**Red Tie Club**
Replacement Behavior

**Pants pulled up**
Desired Behavior

**Points towards extra time at lunch**
Consequence

**Get Peer attention**
Maintaining Consequence/Function

Make the behavior **IRRELEVANT**

Make the behavior **INEFFICIENT**

Make the behavior **INEFFECTIVE**
RD Across the Tiers

RD has the strongest impact when implemented as a whole-school, preventative approach to discipline

McCluskey et al., 2011

- Community Restorative Conferencing
- Family Group Conferencing (FGC)
- Family Group Decision Making (FGDM)
- Peer juries
- Peer mediation
- Shuttle mediation
- Mediation
- Restorative meetings
- Restorative conversations
- Informal conferences
- Problem-solving circles
- Restorative meetings
  - Restorative questioning
  - Affective statements & scripts
  - “Checking-In” circles
  - Using social/emotional curriculum

RD has the strongest impact when implemented as a whole-school, preventative approach to discipline

Preventative strategies

Reactive strategies
Using Affective Statements to Develop Empathy

• “Personal expressions of feeling in response to specific positive or negative behaviors of others.”
  • ‘I statements’
  • Makes ‘offender’ aware of the impact of their actions
  • Changes the dynamic between individuals

I feel frustrated when you don’t address my questions during training.

I feel angry when you disrupt the class because it makes it harder for other students to learn.

I feel happy when you complete your homework because it shows me how well you understand the topic.

Turn & Talk

**Affective statement + behavior**

a) Students quickly volunteer to answer a question

b) Student mocks your voice

c) Colleague completely re-writes your lesson plan
Restorative Meeting

• Classroom- and Office-managed behaviors

• Involves multiple parties

• Circle process could be used
  1. Greeting – every student is acknowledged
  2. Check-in – establish each student’s emotional state
  3. Activity – Define problem, brainstorm possible causes and/or solutions, students come to consensus on 1-2 strategies
  4. Closing – Each student says how they will help
The Restorative Chat
Lucille Eber

1. Tell me what happened.
2. What you were thinking at the time?
3. What do you think about it now?
4. Who did this affect?
5. What do you need to do about it?
6. How can we make sure this doesn't happen again?
7. What I can do to help you?

McIntosh, K. (Oct. 27, 2014). *Enhancing Equity through Effective Professional Development*. PBIS Implementers’ Forum, Chicago, IL.
Restorative Conferencing

• “A structured meeting between:
  • Offenders,
  • Victims, and
  • Both parties’ family and friends

• Where they:
  • Deal with the consequences of a wrongdoing/crime, and
  • Decide how to repair the harm.”

Restorative Script - Offender

1. What happened?
2. What were you thinking at the time?
3. What do you think about it now?
4. Who do you think has been affected by your actions?
5. How have they been affected?

Restorative Script - Victim

1. What was your reaction when the incident occurred?
2. How do you feel about what happened?
3. What has been the hardest thing for you?
4. How did your family & friends react when they heard about the incident?
5. What would you like to be the outcome of the conference?

Reintegration Procedures

Definition: “to integrate again into an entity; to **restore to unity**”  
(Merriam-Webster Dictionary)

What does this mean for schools?
- Part of discipline process
- Varying levels of intensity
- Very intense offenses = increased structure of reintegration
Align consequences to the severity of behavior

Provide explicit guidance for special populations:

- SWD
- ELL
- Homeless youth
- Foster youth
- Students belonging to groups experiencing disproportionate discipline
### Sample Discipline Matrix

Consequences that may be applied to a misbehavior are indicated by a “X.” Multiple consequences may be assigned to a single incident.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Misbehaviors</th>
<th>Verbal or written warning</th>
<th>Corrective Teaching Interaction</th>
<th>In-Class Discipline</th>
<th>Denial of Classroom Privileges (teacher)</th>
<th>Parent contact (verbal or written)</th>
<th>Confiscation of inappropriate item</th>
<th>Confiscation of device (1 or 2 days)</th>
<th>Permanent loss of device</th>
<th>Denial of Privileges (administrator)</th>
<th>Time in Office</th>
<th>Detention Hall</th>
<th>Extended School Detention</th>
<th>Bus Suspension</th>
<th>Etc.</th>
<th>Etc.</th>
<th>Etc.</th>
<th>Disciplinary Alternative Educational Placements (1, 30, 45, or 60 days)***</th>
<th>Expulsion***</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Tardiness</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Disciplinary Alternative Educational Placements (1, 30, 45, or 60 days)***</td>
<td>Expulsion***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disruption</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Disciplinary Alternative Educational Placements (1, 30, 45, or 60 days)***</td>
<td>Expulsion***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>First violation of Technology Regulations</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Disciplinary Alternative Educational Placements (1, 30, 45, or 60 days)***</td>
<td>Expulsion***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Misconduct (cutting in line, minor defacing of property, throwing items from the bus, etc.)</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Disciplinary Alternative Educational Placements (1, 30, 45, or 60 days)***</td>
<td>Expulsion***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dress Code violation</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Disciplinary Alternative Educational Placements (1, 30, 45, or 60 days)***</td>
<td>Expulsion***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Etc.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Disciplinary Alternative Educational Placements (1, 30, 45, or 60 days)***</td>
<td>Expulsion***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Etc.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Disciplinary Alternative Educational Placements (1, 30, 45, or 60 days)***</td>
<td>Expulsion***</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Group 1 Misbehaviors**

**Group 2 Misbehaviors**
Culturally-Responsive Social Skill Instruction and Practice with Affective Statements (Daily)

Restorative practices should be integrated into your school’s multi-tiered system of support for behavior.

Sample Interventions:
- Seating Change
- Student Conference
- Parent Contact
- Student Contract
- Redirection
- Proximity
- Restorative Chat
- Loss of Privilege
- Restitution
- Apology
- Verbal & Non-Verbal Prompt
- Reward Alternate Behavior

Verbal Warning
- Re-state Expectation/Rule

2nd Step (same behavior)
- Re-teach Expectation, reward around student

3rd Step (same behavior)
- Affective Questions & Impromptu Conference
- Contact parent

4th Step (same behavior)
- Classroom behavior report. Contact a peer, guidance, or admin for further intervention/suggestions

5th Step (same behavior)
- Refer to guidance or complete office referral form

For Office Referrals
- Attach completed copies of classroom behavior reports

Verbal Warning
- Re-teach expectation

Behavior stops no further action

Behavior stops further action

Behavior stops further action

Behavior stops further action

Behavior stops further action

Behavior stops further action

Diagram based on Martin County Schools: Hidden Oaks MS flow chart
Vulnerable Decision Points

Referrals by Time

Disrespect

Language
Having conversations...(or standing workgroups)

- Family Focus Groups: FLPBIS Project, 2016
- Learning Labs: Bal, 2016
- Discipline committees, Cincinnati Public Schools: Brown & Beckett, 2006
Mindset

Addressing Barriers to Effective Implementation
Discipline in the South...

55% of suspensions given to African American students occurred in 13 Southern states (Texas included)


For Students with:

- Emotional & behavioral difficulties
- Aggression
- Hyperactivity
- Poor social skills
- Negative experiences w/ school, academics

OSS is less likely to change behavior

Chin et al. (2012); Krezmien, Leone, & Achilles (2006); Atkins et al. (2002); Scott, Nelson, & Liapusin (2001).
Alternative Disciplinary Placements

http://www.indiana.edu/~atlantic/briefing-papers/

Alternative placement during elementary school:

• Half of students were placed in juvenile detention within 4 years

Alternative placement during middle school:

• 43% of students were placed in juvenile detention within 2 years
What are the biggest predictors of a school’s use of suspension?
School factors related to use of suspension

(Christle, Nelson & Jolivette, 2004)

“Observers described a discernable tension in high-suspension schools...from uncoordinated attempts to maintain order through punitive & exclusionary disciplinary practices.”

“Observers noted staff yelling at students in high-suspension schools, while interactions between staff & students at the low-suspension schools were...caring and respectful.”

“Staff from high-suspension schools did not communicate overall confidence and positive attitudes about their administrators...”

Positive post cards home, family picnics were effective for increasing family engagement.
The importance of mindset

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>High-Suspension Schools</th>
<th>Low-Suspension Schools</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Principals enforced rigid disciplinary process</td>
<td>Principals viewed district policies as a flexible guide. Teachers and parents were viewed as partners in the disciplinary process.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- “Principal attitudes were correlated with school suspension rates above and beyond what might be predicted by student and school characteristics.”
- Suspension rates were higher in schools where principals reported a need for additional resources.
  - *Some schools may need to invest in Tier 1 development*

Murkuria (2002)

Skiba et al. (2003); Skiba & Edl (2004)
## Rationale for Suspension

(Chin et al., 2012; Green et al., 2018)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rationale for Suspension</th>
<th>Alternatives</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Remove the offending student (safety)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provide temporary relief to teacher(s)</td>
<td>• Timeout, reflection</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Get parents’ attention</td>
<td>• Authentic, positive, &amp; ongoing family engagement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• System level support for family engagement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Improve the learning environment</td>
<td>• Teach schoolwide expectations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Precorrection</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Opportunities to respond</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deter other students</td>
<td>• Differential reinforcement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Behavior-specific praise</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Active monitoring and supervision</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Should difficult students be suspended LESS in the interest of keeping them on-track to graduate?

Yes, behavioral issues need to be dealt with in a way that doesn't damage the student's academic progress. 20% of 847 votes.

No, students committing major violations deserve out-of-school suspension. 37% of 1,555 votes.

Would-be suspended students can attend after-school programs for study, but they shouldn't be allowed in the main classrooms. 42% of 1,777 votes.

Teachers were more likely to say there was a pattern & request harsher discipline with Black students.

KASAB Model of Professional Development


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Outcomes of Professional Learning</th>
<th>Examples</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Knowledge</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| “Awareness building” - insufficient to change behavior | “Suspension isn’t effective for students who have emotional difficulties.”  
“Pre-correction is an effective alternative to suspension.” |
| **Attitudes**                    |          |
| Beliefs about the value of different strategies | “Telling a student how something made me feel isn’t going to change their behavior.” |
| **Skills**                       |          |
| Strategies to apply knowledge | Name the behavior, the expectation that was demonstrated, and give the student a Tiger Buck. |
| **Aspirations**                  |          |
| The internal motivation to engage in a practice | “I hate the idea of sharing my emotions with students!” |
| **Behaviors**                    |          |
| Consistent and refined application of knowledge & skills | Refer to wall poster of affective vocabulary that includes words my students use at home & in the community. |
Contact Information

Therese Sandomierski, Ph.D.

*Florida’s PBIS Project,*

*University of South Florida*

*tsandomiersk@usf.edu*

[@PBIS_Therese](https://twitter.com/PBIS_Therese)